



PROJECT # 00448

Applications	COA # 0904
Property Address	184 South Swan Street
Property Owner	Dove Street Development, LLC
Historic District	Center Square / Hudson Park
Request	Certificate of Appropriateness
Proposal	Repair the existing masonry stoop and replace the historic brownstone veneer with brick.

Notes/Comments:

The applicant is proposing to remove the damaged historic brownstone veneer on the front entry stoop and repair and stabilize the existing stoop. A number of pieces of the brownstone have come off and in other places the brownstone has begun to spall.

The applicant did reach out to Adam Ross Stone to source and price new brownstone. Adam Ross does have salvaged brownstone on site that matches the existing material and cost at least \$400 apiece. The applicant is requesting approval to remove the existing brownstone, repair and stabilize the stoop, and install new brick in place of the brownstone to match the masonry building.

On Tuesday, November 9, 2021 Commissioners Myers, Pinckney, and Hacker met with Phil Hansen on site to look at the condition of the stoop and the brownstone. The majority of the brownstone is bedfaced and spalling. The mortar bed has failed and the stone has pulled away from the brick under structure.

At the site visit the Commissioners discussed options other than brick for replacing the existing brownstone. The Commissioners asked Mr. Hansen to consider looking at replacement with architectural CMU blocks or a product called Arriscraft both with a rusticated masonry face and tinted to match the existing color. The option to use a past concrete mold to match the existing was also discussed. Mr. Hansen was also encouraged to retain as much of the existing material as possible and only source new brownstone for what needs to be replaced.

It was also requested that the Mason provide a more detailed scope of work outlining how the brick under structure will be stabilized.

Review Consideration for Certificate of Appropriateness Review:

- 375-2(F)(1)(c): General Guidelines
- 375-2(F)(1)(d): Rehabilitation Guidelines

Recommended Action: Deny

The proposed replacement of the historic brownstone veneer with brick does not meet the General and Rehabilitation Guidelines of the Historic Resources-Overlay. The guidelines require that original, character defining features be retained and repaired when possible. If the material is damaged or deteriorated past the point of repair then the replacement material must replicate the original material.



The proposed replacement does not meet Criteria 375-2(F)(1)(c)(ii) and 375-2(F)(1)(c)(v) of the General Guidelines and Criteria 375-2(F)(1)(d)(ii), 375-2(F)(1)(d)(iii), 375-2(F)(1)(d)(v), 375-2(F)(1)(d)(vi), 375-2(F)(1)(d)(xii)A.

Planning staff recommend denial of the proposed replacement of the original brownstone with brick.

Section 375-2 Zoning Districts	
Section 375-2(F) Overlay Districts	
Section 375-2(F)(1) HR-O Historic Resources Overlay	
(c)	GENERAL GUIDELINES
(i)	The general design and character of the proposed alteration or new construction should be compatible with the building and historic district.
(ii)	The scale of the proposed alteration or new construction should relate to the building itself, surrounding buildings, the neighborhood and the historic district.
(iii)	Texture, materials and color should relate to similar features of other structures in the neighborhood.
(iv)	Changes should be visually compatible with surrounding buildings, including the proportion of the building's front façade, the proportion and arrangement of windows and other openings within the façade, the roof shape and the rhythm and spacing of buildings on streets, including setbacks.
(v)	Compatible materials and colors that are either similar to or visually quiet in relation to traditional ones used in the area should be used in new construction or when restoration of original materials is impossible. Inappropriate contemporary materials, including those that attempt fake antiquity or rusticity (e.g., unpainted natural wood, reused common brick, undressed stone or asphalt, aluminum or vinyl siding), are discouraged and are specifically prohibited on front façades and within front setback areas. When appropriate traditional materials cannot be duplicated, preference should be given to contemporary materials, used in a straightforward manner, which blend well with the traditional context of the district or modern materials that achieve the same level of detail.
(vi)	Grounds for considering a proposed design inappropriate would include arresting and spectacular effects, violent contrasts of materials or colors or intense colors or a multiplicity or incongruity of details resulting in a disturbing appearance.
(d)	REHABILITATION GUIDELINES
The following standards for rehabilitation and guidelines for rehabilitating historic buildings are adopted by the Historic Resources Commission to the extent that they affect exterior alterations:	
(i)	Every reasonable effort shall be made to provide a compatible use for a property that requires minimal alteration of the building, structure or site and its environment.
(ii)	The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure or site and its environment shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided whenever possible.
(iii)	All buildings, structures and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historic basis and that seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged.
(iv)	Changes that may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected.
(v)	Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize a building, structure or site shall be treated with sensitivity.
(vi)	Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event that replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplication of features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence, rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.
(vii)	The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting, pressure grit washing and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken.
(viii)	Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archaeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project.
(ix)	Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when

	such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historic, architectural or cultural material and when such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property, neighborhood or environment.
(x)	Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to structures shall be done in such a manner that, if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired.
(xi)	Windows
	A. Original windows should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible.
	B. A replacement window should match the size of the original opening in width, length and depth of placement and should be constructed in the configuration of the existing or original window (i.e., double-hung sash, 2/2, 6/1, 6/6, etc.). In the event that a previously altered, non-compatible window is being replaced on a street-facing façade, the new window should conform with the original opening and be of a style, color and material appropriate to the building. When there is no evidence of the original window, the new one should be complementary to the building design.
	C. The use of interior storm windows is encouraged, but exterior metal or vinyl storm windows the same size as the opening and of an appropriate color are acceptable.
(xii)	Stoops
	A. Brownstone stoops should be repaired rather than replaced. In the event that portions must be replaced, repair materials should match the color of and closely resemble the existing materials. Replacements for brownstone stoops should be of stone or be entirely cast in tinted concrete and should match the color, placement, size, scale and design of originals as closely as possible.
	B. Replacement wooden stoops should match the size, scale, design and placement of the originals or should be appropriate to the original design of the buildings to which they are attached. Each stoop should be painted with a color appropriate to the individual building and the surrounding district.
	C. The consistent rhythm of projecting entrance stoops is an important characteristic of the streetscape in historic areas and should be maintained.
(xiii)	Rails
	When appropriate, original wrought iron rails should be retained when new stoops are built. In the event that a rail is missing, the new rail should be custom-made to be compatible with the style of the building or the surrounding district, where practicable, or be a modern non-decorative rail or a salvaged historic rail appropriate to the style of the building.
(xiv)	Paint and Other Materials
	A. Retention and/or restoration of old materials and original colors is encouraged. Removal or covering over, including painting, of historic and previously unpainted materials is to be avoided whenever practicable.
	B. Historically, Albany common brick was painted; therefore, it should be painted. Harder pressed or face brick was not painted; therefore, these types of brick should be left unpainted.
	C. All exterior paint colors shall be selected by the applicant or the owner. Such color selections shall be reviewed by the Chief Planning Official or his/her designee for consistency with the provisions of this Section 375-2(F)(1).
(xv)	Doors
	Original doors should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. A replacement door should be constructed to fit the entire original opening in length, width, depth of placement and style or configuration.